# Poetry, History and Lament: Readings in the Tisha B'av Kinnot

Marty Lockshin
Torah in Motion, 2020

#### Shaye Cohen, "From Scripture to Midrash"

IN A PERIOD OF LESS than seventy years the Jews of antiquity lost three major wars: the great revolt of 66-74 C.E., the uprising of the Jews of Cyrenaica, Egypt, and Cyprus in 115-17 C.E., and the Bar Kokhba rebellion of 132-35 C.E. Each of these conflicts caused enormous losses in life (if we may believe our sources, over 1,400,000 dead) and property, and each had a major impact on Jewish history. In 70 C.E. Jerusalem and the temple were destroyed, thereby radically altering the map of Judaism. No longer did Judaism have a sacred center, a temple, a priesthood, and a sacrificial cult. The war of 115-17 C.E. marked the final eclipse of the "Golden Age" of Alexandrian Jewry. To punish the Jews for the Bar Kokhba insurrection, the Romans renamed the land of Israel "Syria Palaestina," forbade Jews to dwell in Jerusalem, now a pagan city, and proscribed the practice of Judaism for several years. What was the reaction of the rabbis to these catastrophes?

# Shaye Cohen, "From Scripture to Midrash" (cont.)

At first there was near silence. The rabbis of the tannaitic period (70-200 C.E.) did not write laments or seek refuge in apocalyptic dreams. They did not establish new fast days. Nor did they accord a place in their curriculum to the study of these momentous events. While tannaitic corpora allude frequently to the destruction of the temple, they mention Betar (the site of Bar Kokhba's last stand) only once. They never mention the names of the leaders of the wars of 66-74, 115-17, and 132-35. They never mention Rabban Yohanan ben Zakkai's alleged role in the drama of the great revolt or Rabbi Akiva's alleged endorsement of the messianic claims of Bar Kokhba. They seldom mention the Roman emperors who oppressed the Jews.

# Shaye Cohen, "From Scripture to Midrash" (cont.)

The nature of this tannaitic silence is not clear. Was it silence engendered by shock and despair? Not knowing what to say in the face of catastrophe the rabbis said nothing? Or was it silence engendered by determination? Ignoring the harsh political realities, the rabbis devoted their energies to creating a religious system which would ensure the survival of Judaism. However interpreted, the fact remains that the tannaim did not tell stories or preach sermons about the military disasters of their era. Instead they busied themselves with the production of books of law and exegesis. The study of history had to wait.

#### Yael Ziegler

The book of Eikhah describes the destruction of Jerusalem without providing consolation, clear theological explanations, or guidelines for national rehabilitation. Instead, it presents an evocative and painful account of suffering

# Structure of Eikhah

Chapter 1: 22 verses, alphabetical acrostic

Chapter 2: 22 verses, alphabetical acrostic

Chapter 3: 66 verses, triple alphabetical

acrostic

Chapter 4: 22 verses, alphabetical acrostic

Chapter 5: 22 verses, no alphabetical acrostic

# Who was Elazar ha-Kalir?

#### Elazar ha-Kalir שָׁבַת סוּרוּ

שָׁבַת

<mark>סורו</mark> מָנִי שִׁמְעוּנִי עוֹרְ<u>ר</u>ִי

ָ<mark>סְחִי</mark> וּמָאוֹס הֶשִּׁימוּנִי בְּעֶּדְרֵי חֲבֵרַי.

בכּוֹתָה מִשְׁכָּן מִסְכוֹת דְּבִירֵי.

בַכּוֹתָ וְהָבְלָגוּ גִּבּוֹרֵי.

ָ<mark>ַבָּכְקוּ</mark> כַף וּמָצְדוּ אֵבָרֵי.

בָּ<mark>סְלָד</mark> כֶל אֲבִּירֵי:

Happiness has ceased; "Depart from me" I hear from my detractors. Those who were once my friends call me dirty and repulsive. You have separated Yourself by placing a canopy over Your Holy of Holies. You concealed Yourself [Rosenfield: thou has enveloped (thyself in anger)] and allowed the defeat of my great men; my enemies cheer when I stumble, trampling on all my warriors.

#### Elazar ha-Kalir שָׁבַת סוּרוּ (cont.)

#### Koren

- 1. May those who exiled me hear that their joy is but temporary;
- 2. May You treat their dwellings as they have trampled mine,
- 3. they who silenced the singers of the Temple to torture me.
- 4. You heard that they schemed to sweep me away with "switches of wrath."
- 5. We dug holes in the earth in which to cook, and thus broke our teeth on stones.
- 6. They heard my desperate sighs!

#### Rosenfield

- 1. Bring us back and fulfil the proclamation "Rejoice."
- 2. (while the cup of punishment will be meted out) to the nation who turned me out. They took counsel to trample my courts and have me crushed
- 3. They silenced the lips of the singers of the Temple and caused me pain
- 4. Thou hast heard that they prepared an impure cult to sweep me away
- 5. And when my people lay down or wandered forth, they fed me with gravel
- 6. Having heard full well that I was groaning

#### Kohelet 5:1

אַל הְּבַהֵל עַל פִּידָ, וְלִבְּדָ אַל יְמַהֵר לְהוֹצִיא דָבָר לִפְנֵי הָאֱלֹהִים, כִּי הָאֱלֹהִים בַּשָּׁמַיִם וְאַתָּה עַל הָאָרֶץ עַל כֵּן יִהְיוּ דְבָרֶידְ מְעַטִים

Keep your mouth from being rash, and let not your throat be quick to bring forth speech before God. For God is in heaven and you are on earth; that is why your words should be few.

#### Ibn Ezra on Kohelet 5:1

יש בפיוטי רבי אליעזר הקליר, מנוחתו כבוד, ארבעה דברים קשים. הדבר האחד, כי רובי פיוטיו חידות ומשלים.

והדבר השני, שפיוטיו מעורבים בלשון תלמוד. וידוע כי יש כמה לשונות בתלמוד, ואינימו לשון הקודש. וכן אמרו: "לשון מקרא לחוד ולשון תלמוד לחוד". ומי הביאנו בצרה הזאת, להתפלל בלשונות נכריות? The poems of Rabbi Elazar Ha-Kalir, may he rest in peace, present four major problems. One: Most of his piyyutim consist of riddles and parables.

Two: his poems contain Talmudic terminology. It is well known that there are many words in the Talmud that are not in the Holy Tongue. Now the Rabbis said: the language of Scripture stands by itself, and the language of the Talmud stands by itself. Who brought this disaster upon us of praying in foreign languages?

#### Ibn Ezra on Kohelet 5:1 (cont.)

והדבר השלישי, אפילו המלות שהם בלשון הקדש – יש בהם טעויות גדולות,

והדבר הרביעי, שכל פיוטיו מלאים מדרשות ואגדות; וחכמינו אמרו: "אין מקרא יוצא מידי פשוטו", אם כן אין ראוי להתפלל אלא על דרך פשט, ולא . . . שיתפרש לעניינים רבים. Three: Even the words that are in the holy tongue [in the poems of Kalir] contain major mistakes.

Four: All of Rabbi Elazar's piyyutim are filled with midrash and aggadot. However, our rabbis taught: A verse never departs from its plain meaning. This being so, people should employ only peshat when they pray. They should not . . . say prayers that can be interpreted in many ways.

#### Ibn Ezra on Kohelet 5:1 (cont.)

ולא אוכל לבאר אחד מני אלף מטעות הפייטנים. והטוב בעיני שלא יתפלל אדם בהם, כי אם התפילה הקבועה, ויהי דברינו מעטים I cannot explain even one out of a thousand of the errors made by the payyetanim. In my opinion, people should not employ these poems in their prayers. They should pray using the fixed liturgy. We should keep our words to a minimum.

#### Selections from אי כה אמר

אֵי כּה אֹמֶר כּוֹרֵת לְאָב בְּפֶצַח.

Where is that (joy-laden) promise (God) made to the Patriarch (Abraham) by the utterance (of "Thus [כֹּה]")

בְּבְרִית בֵּין הַבְּתָרִים כֹּה יִהְיֶה לָנֶצַח.

at the covenant between the pieces (when God said): "So [הֹה] (numerous) shall (your descendants) be forever"

ּוְהֵן עַתָּה בָּלְעוּ עֲצָמֵי בְּרֶצַח.

And yet now my bones are destroyed through murder

ָלָמָה אֱלֹהִים זָנַחְתָּ לָנֶצַח:

Why have You forsaken us forever?

#### Selections from אי כה אמר

ָאֵי כֹּה גָּשׁ כְּשֶׂה לְעוֹלָה לְרַצּוֹתֶךְ.

What has become (of the utterance) of "thus [מֹה]" (when Abraham) drew (Isaac) near as a lamb for the burnt offering in order to do Your will

ַנֵלְכָה עַד כֹּה פָּתּוּ בְּעֵדוֹתֶיךָ.

(When Abraham said:) "I and the lad will go yonder [כֹּה]" enticing (You by their obedience) to Your laws

ּוְהֵן עַתָּה דָּקְרוּ כְּפֶלַח רַעְיָתֶךְ.

But now your beloved one is pierced in halves (like pomegranates?)

ָיָעְשַׁן אַפְּרָ בְּצֹאן מַרְעִיתֶךָ:

(why does) Your anger smoke against the flock of your pasture?

#### Selections from אי כה אמר

אַי כּה **ט**וֹב כִּשִׁלַּח גָּאֹל עַבַדִיךְ.

What has become (of the utterance) of "thus" [כֹה] when "Good" (= Moses) was sent to redeem Your servants

ָבּה תֹאמֵר לְשַׁלֵּחַ עַם לְעָבְדֶּךָ. "Thus [כֹּה (שַׁלֵּחַ עַם לְעָבְדֶּךָ. shall you say to Pharaoh" to release (Your people) in order to worship You

וְהֵן עַתָּה יָשְׁבוּ בּוֹגְדִים בְּבֵית But now treacherous men dwell יעודֶר, in the House of Your meeting

ָשָׁאֲגוּ צוֹרְרֶיךָ בְּקֶרֶב מוֹעֲדֶיךָ:

Your enemies roar in the midst of Your place of assembly.

בָּכוֹ תִבִבָּה מִחָמֵשׁת סְפַרִים.

The five-fold Torah cried bitterly

כָּנֵהַרַג כֹּהֶן וְנַבִיא בִּיוֹם הַכִּפּוּרִים.

When a priest and prophet was slain on Yom Kippur

וְעַל דָמוֹ נִשְׁחֲטוּ פְּרָחִים כִּצְפִירִים.

And because of his blood, young priests were slaughtered like goats

וְנָדוּ כְּצִפָּרִים. כֹהַנֵי צְפּוֹרִים:

And the priests of Zippori strayed like birds (in flight)

גּּלְתָה מֵאַרְצָה כַּלָה מְקִשְׁטָה.

On account of the sin of tithes and the sabbatical year

בַּעֲוֹן מַעְשָׂרוֹת וּשְׁמִפֶּה.

(Israel) the bedecked bride was exiled from her land

ּוּרָאַרְבַּעַת שְׁפָטִים הָשְׁפָּטָה.

And was judged with four kinds of punishments

וּמֵעֶדְיָה הַפְשָׁטָה. מִשְׁמֶרֶת מִפְשָׁטָה:

And the shift of (Charim-)
Mifshetah was stripped bare of her adornments

. קיוּ אוֹיְבִים מַלְעִיבִים בְּלוֹחֲמֵי לֶחֶם.

בָּבִטְּלוּ הָלֹא פָרֹס לַרָעֵב לֵחֵם.

וָהֶרְעֲבוּ וְהָצְמְאוּ מִמַּיִם וּמִלֶּחֶם.

ּכְבַּטְלוּ שְׁתֵּי הַלֶּחֶם. מִבֵּית לֶחֶם:

They mocked those sages who fought for (the sake of) the Torah

When they disregarded their plea to share bread with the hungry

They themselves became hungry and thirsty from (lack of) bread and water

When the two loaves in the Temple were cancelled.

ּ זָּכְרָה זְמַן אֲשֶׁר נַעֲשֶׂה וְנִשְׁמָע הֵשִׁיבוּ.

Recall the time when Israel responded, "We will do and we will hear,"

ּוְעַתָּה עֲנוֹת אָמֵן לֹא אָבוּ.

But now they no longer agree (even) to answer "Amen"

לַעֲנָה וָרוֹשׁ שֻׂבְּעוּ וְרָווּ.

They are sated and saturated with wormwood and gall

וָהָקצוּ וְהָלְעֲבוּ. כֹהֲנֵי עַיְלְבוּ:

And the priests of Elbu are loathed and mocked.

רְאֵה ה' וְהַבִּיטָה לְמִי עוֹלַלְתָּ כֹּה אָם תֹאכַלְנָה נָשִׁים פִּרְיָם עֹלֲלֵי טִפָּחִים אָם יֵהָרֵג בְּמִקְדֵּשׁ אֲדֹנָי כֹּהֵן וְנָבִיא

Eikhah 2:20

See, O Lord, and behold,
To whom You have done this!
Alas, women eat their own fruit, their new-born babes!
Alas, priest and prophet are slain in the Sanctuary of the Lord!

#### Gittin 57b

אמר רבי חייא בר אבין אמר רבי יהושע בן קרחה: סח לי זקן אחד מאנשי ירושלים, בבקעה זו הרג נבוזראדן רב טבחים מאתים ואחת עשרה רבוא... Rabbi Yehoshua ben Korḥa said: An old man from among the inhabitants of Jerusalem related to me: In this valley that lies before you, Nebuzaradan, captain of the guard of the Babylonian king Nebuchadnezzar, killed 2,110,000 people . .

אשכחיה לדמיה דזכריה דהוה קא מרתח וסליק, אמר: מאי האי? אמרו ליה: דם זבחים דאשתפוך. אייתי דמי ולא אידמו, Nebuzaradan found the blood of Zechariah, the son of Jehoiada the priest, and saw that it was bubbling up from the ground, and he said: What is this? Those in the Temple said to him: It is sacrificial blood that had been poured there. He brought animal blood, compared it to the blood bubbling up from the ground, and saw that they were not similar.

#### Gittin 57b (cont.)

אמר להו: אי אמריתו לי - מוטב, ואי לאו - מסריקנא לבשרייכו במסרקי דפרזלי. אמרי ליה: מאי נימא לך, נבייא הוה בן דהוה קא מוכח לן במילי דשמיא, קמינן עילויה וקטלינן ליה, והא כמה שנין דלא קא נייח דמיה. Nebuzaradan said to them: If you tell me whose blood this is, it will be well for you. But if not, I will comb your flesh with iron combs. They said to him: What shall we say to you? He was a prophet among us, who used to rebuke us about heavenly matters, and we rose up against him, and killed him (II Chronicles 24:20–22), and for many years now his blood has not settled.

אמר להו: אנא מפייסנא ליה. אייתי סנהדרי גדולה וסנהדרי קטנה קטל עילויה ולא נח, בחורים ובתולות קטל עילויה ולא נח, אייתי תינוקות של בית רבן קטל עילויה ולא נח, א"ל: זכריה, זכריה, טובים שבהן איבדתים, ניחא לך דאבדינהו לכולהו? כדאמר ליה הכי נח. Nebuzaradan said to them: I will appease Zechariah. He brought the members of the Great Sanhedrin and of the lesser Sanhedrin and killed them alongside the bubbling blood, but it still did not settle. He then brought young men and virgins and killed them alongside it, but it still did not settle. He then brought schoolchildren and killed them alongside it, but it still did not settle. Finally Nebuzaradan said (to the blood): Zechariah, Zechariah, I have killed the best of them. Would it please you if I destroyed them all? When he said this, the blood at last settled.

#### Gittin 57b (cont.)

בההיא שעתא הרהר תשובה בדעתיה, אמר: ומה אם על נפש אחת - כך, ההוא גברא דקטל כל הני נשמתא - על אחת כמה וכמה! ערק אזל שדר שטר פרטתא בביתיה ואגייר

At that moment Nebuzaradan contemplated the idea of repentance and said to himself: If, for the death of one soul, that of Zechariah, God punishes the Jewish people in this manner, then that man (that is to say, I), who has killed all of those souls, all the more so will be I be subject to great punishment from God. He fled, sent to his house a document detailing what was to be done with his property, and converted to Judaism

רְאֵה ה' וְהַבִּיטָה לְמִי עוֹלַלְתָּ כֹּה אָם תֹאכַלְנָה נָשִׁים פִּרְיָם עֹלֲלֵי טִפָּחִים אָם יֵהָרֵג בְּמִקְדֵּשׁ אֲדֹנָי כֹּהֵן וְנָבִיא

Eikhah 2:20

See, O Lord, and behold,
To whom You have done this!
Alas, women eat their own fruit, their new-born babes!
Alas, priest and prophet are slain in the Sanctuary of the Lord!

### II Chronicles 24:20-21

(כ) וְרוּחַ אֱלֹהִים לַבְשָׁה אֶת זְכַרְיָה בֶּן יְהוֹיָדָע הַכּּהֵן וַיַּעֲמֹד מֵעַל לָעָם וַיֹּאמֶר לָהֶם כֹּה אָמֵר הָאֶלֹהִים לָמָה אַתָּם עֹבְרִים אֶת לְּעָם וַיֹּאמֶר לָהֶם כֹּה אָמֵר הָאֶלֹהִים לָמָה אַתָּם עֹבְרִים אֶת ה' וַיַּעֲזֹב אֶתְכֶם: אֶת מִצְוֹת הֹיְ וְלֹא תַצְלִיחוּ כִּי עֲזַבְהָם אֶת ה' וַיִּיְאָרוּ עָלִיו וַיִּרְגְּמָהוּ אֶבֶן בְּמִצְוַת הַמֶּלֶךְ בַּחַצַר בֵּית (כא) וַיִּקְשְׁרוּ עָלָיו וַיִּרְגְּמָהוּ אֶבֶן בְּמִצְוַת הַמֶּלֶךְ בַּחַצֵר בֵּית ה':

Then the spirit of God enveloped Zechariah son of Jehoiada the priest; he stood above the people and said to them, "Thus God said: Why do you transgress the commandments of the Lord when you cannot succeed? Since you have forsaken the Lord, He has forsaken you." <sup>21</sup>They conspired against him and pelted him with stones in the court of the House of the Lord, by order of the king.

## II Chronicles 24:22-23

וְלֹא זָכַר יוֹאָשׁ הַמֶּלֶּךְ הַחֶּסֶד אֲשֶׁר עֲשָׂה יְהוֹיָדָע אָבִיו עִמּוֹ וַיַּהְרֹג אֶת בְּנוֹ וּכְמוֹתוֹ אָמַר יֵרָא ה' וִיִּדְרשׁ.

וֹיְהִי לִתְקוּפַת הַשְּׁנָה עָלָה עָלִיו חֵיל אֲרָם וַיָּבֹאוּ אֶל יְהוּדָה וִירוּשְׁלַם וַיַּשְׁחִיתוּ אֶת כָּל שָׁרֵי הָעָם מֵעָם וְכָל שְׁלָלָם שִׁלְחוּ לְמֶלֶה יְרַל שִׁלָלָם שִׁלְחוּ לְמֶלֶה יִרמשׁה. King Joash disregarded the loyalty that his father Jehoiada had shown to him, and killed his son. As he was dying, he said, "May the Lord see and requite it."

<sup>23</sup>At the turn of the year, the army of Aram marched against him; they invaded Judah and Jerusalem, and wiped out all the officers of the people from among the people, and sent all the booty they took to the king of Damascus.

#### End of אם תאכלנה נשים (with Koren translation)

וְרוּחַ הַקּדָשׁ לְמוּלָם מַרְעִים.

The Holy Spirit thunders against them:

הוֹי עַל כַּל שָׁכֵנֵי הָרָעִים.

Woe to the wicked of the Jewish people!

מַה שֶׁהִקְרָאָם מוֹדִיעִים.

They inform others about what has befallen them

ָוְאֵת אֲשֶׁר עֲשׂוּ לֹא מוֹדִיעִים.

But do not inform others about what they have done

"אָם תֹאכַלְנָה נָשִׁים פִּרְיָם" מַשְׁמִיעִים.

They give voice to the fact that women eat their own children,

"וְאָם יֵהָרֵג בְּמִקְדַּשׁ יְיָ כּהֵן וְנְבִיא" לֹא מַשִּׁמִיעִים: But to the fact that they killed a prophet and a priest in the Temple, they do not give voice

רְאֵה ה' וְהַבִּיטָה לְמִי עוֹלַלְתָּ כֹּה אָם תֹאכַלְנָה נָשִׁים פִּרְיָם עֹלֲלֵי טִפָּחִים אָם יֵהָרֵג בְּמִקְדֵּשׁ אֲדֹנָי כֹּהֵן וְנָבִיא

Eikhah 2:20

See, O Lord, and behold,
To whom You have done this!
Alas, women eat their own fruit, their new-born babes!
Alas, priest and prophet are slain in the Sanctuary of the Lord!

#### Two translations of ורוח הקודש למולם מרעים

#### Koren

The Holy Spirit thunders against them:

Woe to the wicked of the Jewish people!

They inform others about what has befallen them

But do not inform others about what they have done

They give voice to the fact that women eat their children,

But to the fact that they killed a prophet and a priest in the Temple, they do not give voice

#### Rosenfield

The Holy One thunders (His anger, exclaiming):

"Woe to all my bad neighbours."

They announce the fate which they brought (upon Israel)

But what they themselves committed they do not announce

When women are forced to eat their own offspring they proclaim (the scandal)

But when they themselves slay a priest and a prophet in the Sanctuary of the Lord, they do not publish it.

#### Selections from אש תוקד בקרבי

אַשׁ תּוּקֵד בְּקְרָבִי בְּהַעֲלוֹתִי עַל לְבָבִי, בְּצֵאתִי מִמִּצְרָיִם

> קינִים אָעִירָה, לְמַעַן אַזְכִּירָה, בְּצֵאתִי מִירוּשֶׁלַיִם . . .

גַּלֵי יָם הָמוּ, וְכַחוֹמָה קָמוּ, בְּצֵאתִי מִמִּצְרָיִם

זְדוֹנִים שָׁטָפוּ, וְעֵל רֹאשִׁי צָפוּ, בְּצֵאתִי מִירוּשָׁלַיִם A fire burns within me when I recall when I left Egypt

But I invoke lamentation to remember when I left Jerusalem .

•

The waves of the sea raised themselves and stood erect as a wall when I left Egypt

The foe flooded me, overflowing my head, when I left Jerusalem

#### Selections from אש תוקד בקרבי

זָבַח וּמִנְחָה, וְשֶׁמֶן הַמִּשְׁחָה, בְּצֵאתִי מִמִּצְרָיִם

סְגַלַּת אֵל לְקוּחָה, כַּצאֹן לַטִּבְחָה, בְּצֵאתִי מִירוּשָׁלָיִם

יוֹבֵל וּשְׁמִטָּה, וְאֶרֶץ שׁוֹקֵטָה, בְּצֵאתִי מִמְצְרַיִם

מָכוּר לִּצְמִיתוּת וְכָתוּב לִכְרִיתוּת, בְּצֵאתִי מִירוּשָׁלָיִם . . . Sacrifices, meal offerings and anointing oil when I left Egypt

But God's treasure led away like sheep to the slaughter when I left Jerusalem

Jubilee and Sabbatical years, and a tranquil land when I left Egypt

But I was sold in perpetuity, forever severed when I left Jerusalem . . .

#### Selections from אש תוקד בקרבי

שָׁלְחָן וּמְנוֹרָה, וְכָלִיל וּקְטוֹרָה, בְּצֵאתִי מִמִּצְרָיִם

The Table, the Menorah, burnt offerings and incense when I left Egypt

ָנְאֶלִיל וְתוֹעֵבָה, וּפָסֶל מַצֵּבָה, הְצֵאתִי מִירוּשָׁלָיִם But idols, abominations and graven images when I left Jerusalem

תוֹרָה וּתְעוּדָה, וּכְלֵי הַחֶמְדָה, בְּצֵאתִי מִמִּצְרָיִם The Torah, and its message, and precious vessels when I left Egypt

שָׁשׂוֹן וְשִׂמְחָה, וְנָס יָגוֹן וַאֲנָחָה, בְּשׁוּבִי לִירוּשָׁלָיִם Happiness and joy, gone are sorrow and sighing, when I **return** to Jerusalem